

Case 3573***Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798 (currently *Heteropsis narcissus*; Lepidoptera, NYMPHALIDAE): proposed conservation of the specific name**

Emilio Balletto

Dipartimento di Biologia Animale, Via Accademia Albertina 17 – I-10123, Torino, Italy (e-mail: emilio.balletto@unito.it)

David C. Lees*

Department of Life Sciences, Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London, SW7 5BD, U.K. (e-mail: dclees@gmail.com)

**Corresponding author*

Abstract. The purpose of this application, under Article 23.9.5 of the Code, is to conserve the specific name *Heteropsis narcissus* (Fabricius, 1798), a junior primary homonym of *Hypochrysops narcissus* (Fabricius, 1775). Both names are currently in use to designate separate and well-recognized species, belonging to two distinct genera in two butterfly families from different geographic regions, *Heteropsis* Westwood, 1850 (NYMPHALIDAE from the Malagasy Region) and *Hypochrysops* C. & R. Felder, 1860 (LYCAENIDAE from the Australian region). As both specific names are currently widely used without confusion for taxa in different biogeographic regions, we request the Commission to rule that the name *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798 be conserved despite being a junior homonym of *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1775.

Keywords. Nomenclature; taxonomy; NYMPHALIDAE; LYCAENIDAE; SATYRINAE; THECLINAE; *Hypochrysops*; *Heteropsis*; *Hypochrysops narcissus*; *Heteropsis narcissus*; Narcissus Jewel; Madagascar; Comoros; Mascarenes; Mauritius; Australia.

1. *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1775 and *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798 are primary homonyms (Lees et al., 2003; Lamas, 2010). Both are currently widely used for two different species, the first in the family LYCAENIDAE, subfamily THECLINAE, tribe LUCINI, genus *Hypochrysops* in the Australasian tropics, and the second in the family NYMPHALIDAE, subfamily SATYRINAE, tribe SATYRINI, subtribe MYCALESINA, genus *Heteropsis* in the Afrotropics (Malagasy Region). *Heteropsis narcissus* has no regularly used common name and *Hypochrysops narcissus* is known as the Narcissus Jewel; both are well known species. The two species have not been considered congeneric since the 19th century. The junior homonym has six junior subjective synonyms detailed here and replacement with the next available synonym at species level might appear straightforward. However, the species-group name of the relevant populations of the satyrine butterfly from Mauritius lacks a junior synonym, and would require a new name at potential subspecific rank.

2. *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1775 (p. 524; n° 342) was transferred to the genus *Polyommatus* Latreille, 1804 by Godart ([1824], p. 661, then to *Miletus* Hübner,

[1819] by Butler ([1870], p. 159), and finally to its present genus, *Hypochrysops* C. & R. Felder, 1860 by Druce (1891, p. 189). *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798 (p. 428) was transferred to the genus *Satyrus* Latreille, 1810 by Godart ([1824], p. 551) in which it was maintained by Boisduval (1833, p. 207), to *Coenonympha* Hübner, [1819] by Doubleday (1848, p. 33), and later to *Mycalesis* Hübner, 1818, by Trimen (1866, p. 336), in which it was also included by Butler (1868a, p. 721; 1868b, p. 146; [1870], p. 35). It was later moved to the genus *Henotesia* Butler, 1879 by Aurivillius (1899, p. 63) in which it has frequently been placed (e.g. Roos, 2003), and finally to *Heteropsis* Westwood, [1850] by Lees et al. (2003). The name *narcissus* is in current use in two different genera. As recognised by Lees et al. (2003), under Article 23.9.5 of the Code, it is mandatory to submit an application to the Commission for a decision in the interest of nomenclatural stability.

3. *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1775 (p. 524, n° 342) is currently classified as *Hypochrysops narcissus* (Fabricius, 1775), a well-known Australian lycaenid butterfly species. The type locality was cited as 'nova Hollandia' [= Australia, probably Cooktown, Queensland: (see Sands, 1986, p. 37; Edwards et al., 2001, p. 231)]. The type deposition is at the Natural History Museum, London (BMNH). The type series comprises one male ventrally mounted specimen, BMNH(E) #668218, referred to as 'holotype' by Sands (1986, p. 37) and thus lectotype under Article 74.6 of the Code, a second male dorsally mounted specimen in the Hunterian Museum, Glasgow, GLAHM 127082, thus paralectotype (identified as part of the original Fabricius material by Harish Gaonkar in November 2003 on the website of the Hunterian Museum) and one further paralectotype from Zoological Museum of Kiel University, now on permanent loan to the Zoological Museum of the Natural History Museum in Copenhagen (ZMUC) (see Zimsen, 1964, p. 517 and also Kristensen & Karsholt, 2008a). *Hypochrysops narcissus* has several subjective junior synonyms currently in use to designate up to six subspecies (two, including the nominotypical subspecies, from NE Queensland, Australia and the Torres Strait islands, and up to four other subspecies from Indonesia (Irian Jaya) and Papua New Guinea; see Sands, 1986). Although some subspecies may vary clinally (Braby, 2000, p. 654), its nomenclature is not expected to change significantly. In this case, the most senior available synonym (according to Sands, 1986) is *Hesperia livius* Fabricius, 1793 (p. 315, n° 194). The type material is probably lost (see Zimsen, 1964, p. 563, n° 1067; Edwards et al., 2001, p. 232 and Kristensen & Karsholt, 2008b). TL: 'in Indiis' [recte somewhere in the Australian region, perhaps mainland Australia].

4. *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798 (p. 428) is the original combination of a well known butterfly species currently classified in *Heteropsis* Westwood, [1850] (type species by monotypy *Heteropsis drepana* Westwood, 1850; Lepidoptera, NYMPHALIDAE: SATYRINAE; see Lees, 1997; Lees et al., 2003; Kodandaramaiah et al., 2010). This species is currently listed as *Heteropsis narcissus* (Fabricius, 1798) (see M.C. Williams, 2007). Its type locality was originally stated as 'ad Cap. Bon. Spei' [Cape of Good Hope, South Africa] and was later corrected to 'Mauritius' by Butler (1868b, p. 146, n° 84 and [1870], p. 35, n° 14). The type material is preserved in the Copenhagen Zoological Museum (ZMUC two specimens: see Zimsen, 1964, p. 581; Lees et al., 2003; Kristensen & Karsholt, 2008b). From the two known syntypes, the dorsally mounted male ZMUC00020829 is here designated as lectotype and the side mounted female ZMUC00020830 as paralectotype. Both specimens apparently

belong to the Mauritius population. The species has been considered valid (Ackery et al., 1995, p. 299; Lees et al., 2003) and is part of a group of at least six morphologically slightly different taxa either treated as separate species (Ackery et al., 1995, pp. 298–299; Turlin, 1994, pp. 373–376) or, more recently, as subspecies of *H. narcissus* (Lees et al., 2003, Tab. 8.50; M.C. Williams, 2007), a situation that might require further resolution. Each *H. narcissus* subspecies is endemic to a separate sub-equatorial Indian Ocean island within the Malagasy Subregion of the Afrotropical Region, specifically in the Comoros, Madagascar and Mascarenes (excluding Rodrigues). By date of publication, we have:

- (a) *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798 (p. 428). TL (Type locality): [Mauritius].
- (b) *Mycalesis fraterna* Butler, 1868 (p. 145, n° 83, Pl. 3, Fig. 13). TL: ‘Madagascar’. TD (Type Deposition): BMNH.
- (c) *Mycalesis evanescens* Saalmüller, 1884 (p. 91, n° 140). TL: ‘N.-B.’ [= Nosy-Bé]. TD: Frankfurt. Ackery et al. (1995, p. 299) treated *M. evanescens* as a synonym of ‘*Henotesia narcissus fraterna* (Butler, 1868) and Lees (1997, p. 381) considered this taxon to represent just a wet season form of ‘*Heteropsis fraterna*’. Considering that Nosy-Bé was joined to Madagascar during recent glaciations, *M. evanescens* is unlikely to represent an insular subspecies of *Heteropsis narcissus*.
- (d) *Culapa mayottensis* Oberthür, 1916 (p. 228, n° 81, Pl. CCCLXIX, Figs. 3077–3078). TL: ‘île Mayotte’ [Comoro Islands]; TD: BMNH.
- (e) *Culapa borbonica* Oberthür, 1916 (p. 232, n° 84, Pl. CCCLXIX, Figs. 3083–3084). TL: ‘île Bourbon [= Réunion]: Salazie’. TD: BMNH.
- (f) *Culapa comorensis* Oberthür, 1916 (p. 229, n° 82, Pl. CCCLXIX, Figs. 3079–3080). TL: ‘îles Comores’ [= Comoro Islands]. Lectotype collected by Léon Humblot in 1885/1886 attributed to the Anjouan population by Turlin (1994, p. 375, n° 5); status of the Mohéli population therefore requires further evaluation. TD: BMNH.
- (g) *Culapa comorensis salimi* Turlin, 1994 (p. 375, [Pl. 1], Figs 1, 2). TL: ‘Grande Comore: 4/5 km Est de Nioumbadjou Bandalamadji, 640m 15/18.III.1980’ [Comoro Islands]. TD: Muséum National d’Histoire Naturelle, Paris.

No objective, nor other subjective junior synonyms of the name *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798 are available.

5. The case, involving an application to consider under Article 23.9.5 of the Code a case of primary homonymy already recognized by Lees et al. (2003) and Lamas (2010, p. 199), is relatively straightforward in that it only leaves two options:

- (i) The Commission rules under its plenary power that both names are deemed available (they are unlikely to be confused as the types come from different regions). This course of action was taken for instance in the case of *Papilio sapho* Drury, 1782, a junior primary homonym of *Papilio sapho* Pallas, 1771, nymphalid butterflies currently treated in different genera and biogeographic regions, for which case the Commission ruled that Drury’s name is not invalid by reason of being a junior primary homonym (BZN 63(2): 144–145, June 2006).
- (ii) The Commission recognizes the state of homonymy and the junior homonym, *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1798, would need a replacement name. In this case, the junior homonym would be replaced by a new name, to designate the

Mauritius populations (Lamas, 2010). In order to retain the currently used concept of the species, this new name would be introduced as a subspecies of *Heteropsis fraterna* (Butler, 1868).

6. Both names which have been widely used in previous works (e.g. Manders, 1908; Vinson, 1938; Desegaulx de Nolet, 1982; Ackery et al., 1985; Sands, 1986; Parsons, 1998; Braby, 2000; Guillermet, 2004; J.R. Williams, 2007; M.C. Williams, 2007; Martiré & Rochat, 2008). Because the two species are currently considered valid and are currently placed in genera in different families and occur in different geographical regions and because they cannot be easily confused and will not be considered as congeneric in future, nomenclatural stability would be best promoted by conserving their present usages. For the satyrine butterfly, rather than using the next available synonym at species level (b, para 4) and proposing a new name for the population from Mauritius, it appears less complicated to us to follow the course of action suggested below.

7. The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:

- (1) to use its plenary power to rule that the name *narcissus* Fabricius, 1798, published in the binomen *Papilio narcissus*, is not invalid by reason of being a junior primary homonym of *Papilio narcissus* Fabricius, 1775;
- (2) to place on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology the following names:
 - (a) *narcissus* Fabricius, 1775, as published in the binomen *Papilio narcissus*;
 - (b) *narcissus* Fabricius, 1798, as published in the binomen *Papilio narcissus*, with the endorsement that it is not invalid by reason of being a junior primary homonym of *narcissus* Fabricius, 1775, as published in the binomen *Papilio narcissus*, as ruled in (1) above.

Acknowledgements

Ole Karsholt (*Zoological Museum of Copenhagen*) is thanked for checking and sending information on the types of *Papilio narcissus*, Fabricius 1798. Torben B. Larsen kindly made some substantial suggestions and improvements to the manuscript. Geoff Hancock (*The Hunterian (Zoology) Museum, University of Glasgow*) is also thanked for information about Fabrician types.

References

- Ackery, P.R., Smith, C.R. & Vane-Wright, R.I. 1995. *Carcasson's African butterflies. An Annotated Catalogue of the Papilionoidea and Hesperioidea of the Afrotropical Region*. 803 pp. CSIRO Publications, Melbourne.
- Aurivillius, [P.O.]C. 1899. Rhopalocera Aethiopica. Die Tagfalter des aethiopischen Faunengebietes. Eine Systematisch-Geographische Studie. *Kongliga Svenska Vetenskaps-Akademiens Handlingar*, 31(5): 1–561. [Publication date from a statement on p. 561 in that work].
- Boisduval, J.B.A. 1833. Mémoire sur les lépidoptères de Madagascar, Bourbon et Maurice. *Nouvelles Annales du Muséum d'Histoire Naturelle* (Paris), (3)2(2): 149–270, 7 pls. [Publication date from Sherborn, 1914].
- Braby, M.F. 2000. *Butterflies of Australia. Their identification, biology and distribution*, 2, 976 pp. CSIRO Publishing, Collingwood, Australia.
- Butler, A.G. 1868a. Remarks on the Fabrician species of the satyride genus *Mycalesis*; with descriptions, and notes on the named varieties. *Proceedings of the Zoological Society of London*, 1867(3): 718–721.

- Butler, A.G.** 1868b. *Catalogue of diurnal Lepidoptera of the family Satyridae in the collection of the British Museum*. 211 pp., 5 pls. Taylor and Francis, London.
- Butler, A.G.** [1870]. *Catalogue of diurnal Lepidoptera described by Fabricius in the collection of the British Museum*. 303 pp., 3 pls. Taylor & Francis, London. [Publication date from Sherborn, 1934].
- Desegaulx de Nolet, A.** 1982. Entomofaune des îles de l'Océan Indien zone sud-ouest: Lepidoptères: Rhopalocères, Arctiidae, Sphingidae. *Info-Nature, Île de la Réunion*, **19**: 15–117.
- Doubleday, E.** 1848. *List of the specimens of lepidopterous insects in the collection of the British Museum*, Appendix: [ii], 37 pp. Spottiswoode & Shaw, London [the name appeared in the Appendix published on [5 August] 1848].
- Druce, H.H.** 1891. A monograph of the lycaenid genus *Hypochrysops*, with descriptions of new species. *Transactions of the Entomological Society of London*, **1891**(2): 179–195.
- Edwards, E.D., Newland, J. & Regan, L.** 2001. *Zoological catalogue of Australia*. 31.6. *Lepidoptera Hesperioidea, Papilionoidea*. 615 pp. Csiro Publishing, Melbourne.
- Fabricius, J.C.** 1775. *Systema entomologiae, sistens insectorum classes, ordines, genera, species, adiectis synonymis, locis, descriptionibus, observationibus*. xxxii, 832 pp. Officina Libraria Kortii, Flensburgi & Lipsiae.
- Fabricius, J.C.** 1793. *Entomologia systematica*, vol. 3(1). [6], 487 pp. Hafniae.
- Fabricius, J.C.** 1798. *Supplementum entomologiae systematicae*. 572 pp. Proft & Storch, Hafniae.
- Godart, J.B.** [1824]. Pp. 329–828 in Latreille, P.A. & Godart, J.B. (1819-[1824]), *Encyclopédie Méthodique. Histoire naturelle. Entomologie, ou histoire naturelle des crustacés, des arachnides et des insects*, **9**(2). Veuve Agasse, Paris. [Publication date from Passos, 1958].
- Guillermet, C.** 2004. Contribution à l'étude de l'entomofaune de l'île de la Réunion (Lepidoptera, Heterocera et Coleoptera). *Nouvelle Revue d'Entomologie*, (N.S.) **20**(4): 373–389.
- Hemming, F.** 1941. The dates of publication of the specific names first published in Doubleday, (E.) Genera of diurnal Lepidoptera, and in the continuation thereof by Westwood, (J.O.). *Journal of the Society for the Bibliography of Natural History*, **1** (11): 447–464.
- Hübner, J.** [1819]. *Verzeichniss bekannter Schmetterlinge (Anzeiger, &c.)*. 1816-[1827]. 431 pp. Augsburg (Publication date is after ICZN Opinion 150; Opinions and Declarations, **2**: 161–168, December 1843).
- Kodandaramaiah, U., Lees, D.C., Müller, C.J., Torres, E., Karanth, C.P. & Wahlberg, N.** 2010. Phylogenetics and biogeography of a spectacular Old World radiation of butterflies: the subtribe Mycalesina (Lepidoptera: Nymphalidae: Satyrini). *BMC Evolutionary Biology*, **10**: 172, doi:10.1186/1471-2148-10-172.
- Kristensen, N.P. & Karsholt, O.** 2008a. *Zoological Museum Copenhagen: Fabricius Types Order Lepidoptera (author Fabricius 1775–1787)*. <http://www.zmuc.dk/entoweb/collections-databaser/lepidoptera/lepidoptera%20fabricius1775-87.htm>. Accessed October 22, 2012.
- Kristensen, N.P. & Karsholt, O.** 2008b. *Zoological Museum Copenhagen: Fabricius Types Order Lepidoptera (author Fabricius 1793–1807)*. <http://www.zmuc.dk/entoweb/collections-databaser/lepidoptera/lepidoptera%20fabricius1775-87.htm>. Accessed October 22, 2012.
- Lamas, G.** 2010. Nomenclatural notes on Satyrinae (Lepidoptera: Nymphalidae). *SHILAP Revista de Lepidopterologia*, **38**(150): 197–204.
- Lamas, G. & Mallet, J.L.B.** 2005. *Papilio sapho* Drury, 1782 (currently *Heliconius sapho*; Insecta, Lepidoptera): proposed conservation of the specific name. *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature*, **62**(1): 21–24.
- Lees, D.C.** 1997. *Systematics and biogeography of Madagascan mycalesine butterflies (Lepidoptera: Satyrinae)*. 411 pp. Unpublished PhD thesis, University of London.
- Lees, D.C., Kremen, C. & Raharitsimba, T.** 2003. Classification, diversity and endemism of the butterflies (Papilionoidea and Hesperioidea): A revised species checklist. Pp. 762–793 (most pages unnumbered) in Goodman, S.M. and Benstead, J. P. (Eds.), *The Natural history of Madagascar*. 1709 pp. University of Chicago Press, Chicago & London.
- Manders, N.** 1908. The butterflies of Mauritius and Bourbon. *Transactions of the Entomological Society of London*, **1907**(4): 429–454.

- Martiré, D. & Rochat, J.** 2008. *Les papillons de la Réunion et leurs chenilles*. 496 pp. Biotope, Mèze.
- Oberthür, C.** 1916. Observations sur une centurie d'espèces de Lépidoptères Rhopalocères malgaches. *Études de Lépidoptérologie Comparée*, **11**: 177–244, pls. 365–369.
- Parsons, M.J.** [1998]. *The butterflies of Papua New Guinea. Their systematics and biology*. 736 pp. Academic Press, London & New York.
- Passos, C.F. dos.** 1958. The dates and authorships of the names proposed in volume 9 of Encyclopédie méthodique by Godart and Latreille, 1819-[1824]. *Lepidopterists' News*, **12**(3–4): 119–120.
- Roos, P.H.** 2003. Morphological characters of the immature stages of *Henotesia narcissus* (Fabricius, 1798): description and phylogenetic significance (Lepidoptera: Nymphalidae, Satyrinae, Satyrini, Mycalesina). *Nachrichten des Entomologischen Vereins Apollo*, **23**(4): 225–236.
- Saalmüller, M.** 1884. *Lepidopteren von Madagascar. Neue und wenig bekannte Arten zumeist aus der Sammlung der Senckenberg'schen naturforschenden Gesellschaft zu Frankfurt am Main unter Berücksichtigung der gesammten Lepidopteren-Fauna Madagascars*. 531 pp. Senckenberg'sche naturforschende Gesellschaft, Frankfurt am Main.
- Sands, D.P.A.** 1986. A revision of the genus *Hypochrysops* C. & R. Felder (Lepidoptera: Lycaenidae). *Entomonograph*, **7**: 1–116.
- Sherborn, C.D.** 1914. An attempt at a fixation of the dates of issue of the parts of the publications of the Musée d'Histoire Naturelle of Paris, 1800–1850. *Annals and Magazine of Natural History*, (8)**13**(75): 365–368.
- Sherborn, C.D.** 1934. Dates of publication of catalogues of natural history post 1850 issued by the British Museum. *Annals and Magazine of Natural History*, (10)**13**(74): 308–312.
- Trimen, R.** 1866. Notes on the butterflies of Mauritius. *Transactions of the Entomological Society of London*, (3)**5**(4): 329–344.
- Turlin, B.** 1994. Faune lépidoptérologique de l'Archipel des Comores (Océan Indien). (Rhopalocères, Sphingides, Attacidae) (4). *Lambillionea*, **94**(3)(2): 372–388.
- Vinson, J.** 1938. Catalogue of the Lepidoptera of the Mascarene Islands. *Mauritius Institute Bulletin*, **1**(4): 1–69.
- Westwood, J.O.** [1850]. Pp. 252–534 in Doubleday, E. & Westwood, J.O. (1846–52). *The genera of diurnal Lepidoptera*, 2: [ii]. London. [Publication date from Hemming, 1941].
- Williams, J.R.** 2007. *Butterflies of Mauritius*. 48 pp. Bioculture Press, Rivière des Anguilles, Mauritius.
- Williams, M.C.** 2007. *Afrotropical butterflies and skippers*. <http://www.atbutterflies.com/index.htm>. Digital format encyclopaedia. Accessed 22/10/2012.
- Zimsen, E.** 1964. *The type material of I.C. Fabricius*. 656 pp. Munksgaard, Copenhagen.

Acknowledgement of receipt of this application was published in BZN **69**: 84.

Comments on this case are invited for publication (subject to editing) in the *Bulletin*; they should be sent to the Executive Secretary, I.C.Z.N., c/o Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London SW7 5BD, U.K. (e-mail: iczn@nhm.ac.uk).